Montgomery and mental health: shared decision-making based on evidence and values

MQ Conference
07.02.19
Bill Fulford

Collaborating Centre for Values-based Practice
St Catherine's College, Oxford
What does Montgomery mean for mental health?
What does Montgomery mean for mental health?

It means **Shared Decision-making based on Values and Evidence**.
What does Montgomery mean for mental health?

• Montgomery
• Challenges and Resources
• Clinical examples
• Conclusions
What does Montgomery mean for mental health?

• Montgomery
  What it means
• Challenges and Resources
  Values/VBP and Evidence/EBP
• Clinical examples
  Surgery and psychiatry
• Conclusions
What does Montgomery mean for mental health?

• Montgomery
• Challenges and Resources
• Clinical examples
• Conclusions
The Montgomery Supreme Court ruling (2015)

Montgomery (Appellant) v Lanarkshire Health Board (Respondent), April 2015
Montgomery

Early commentaries …

Even longer lists of side effects
Montgomery
NOT about . . .

Even longer lists of side effects

Not about ‘bombarding the patient with technical information which she cannot reasonably be expected to grasp’

(para 90)
Patient’s values ...

‘A patient is entitled to take into account her own values, her own assessment of the comparative merits of giving birth in the “natural” and traditional way and of giving birth by caesarean section ...

(para 115)
Montgomery IS about …

Evidence …

‘A patient is entitled to take into account her own values, her own assessment of the comparative merits of giving birth in the “natural” and traditional way and of giving birth by caesarean section … alongside the medical assessment of the risks to herself and her baby.’

(para 115)
Montgomery IS about …

Shared decision-making …

‘A patient is entitled to take into account her own values, her own assessment of the comparative merits of giving birth in the “natural” and traditional way and of giving birth by caesarean section … alongside the medical assessment of the risks to herself and her baby.’

(para 115)
What does Montgomery mean for mental health?

It means **Shared Decision-making based on Values and Evidence**
Montgomery based on GMC model of consent ...
The Montgomery/GMC model of consent

Elbow Room for Best Practice?
Montgomery, Patients’ Values, and Balanced Decision-making in Person-centered Clinical care

JONATHAN HERRING, K. W. M. FULFORD, MICHAEL DUNN AND ASHOK I. HANDA

Montgomery IS about …

A model of consent based on a shared view of the

◆ Benefits and
◆ Risks of
◆ Alternative treatments including the
◆ No treatment option established through
◆ Dialogue
Montgomery IS about …

A **model of consent** based on coming to a shared view of the

- **Benefits** and
- **Risks**
judged by the **patient’s values**

- **Alternative treatments**
  including the
- **No treatment** option
judged by the **best evidence**

established through
- **Dialogue**
What does Montgomery mean for mental health?

It means **Shared Decision-making based on Values and Evidence**
What does Montgomery mean for mental health?

It means **Consent depends on Shared Decision-making based on Values and Evidence**
What does Montgomery mean for mental health?

- Montgomery
- Challenges and Resources
- Clinical examples
- Conclusions
A **model of consent** based on coming to a shared view of the

◆ **Benefits** and
◆ **Risks**
judged by the **patient’s values**

◆ **Alternative treatments**
including the
◆ **No treatment** option
judged by the **best evidence**

established through
◆ **Dialogue**
Montgomery

Many Challenges - TIME

A model of consent based on coming to a shared view of the

- Benefits and
- Risks
judged by the patient’s values

- Alternative treatments including the
- No treatment option
judged by the best evidence

established through
- Dialogue TIME
Montgomery
Many Challenges – Values and Evidence

A model of consent based on coming to a shared view of the

◆ Benefits and
◆ Risks
judged by the patient’s values

◆ Alternative treatments including the
◆ No treatment option
judged by the best evidence

established through
◆ Dialogue
Montgomery
Many Resources – VBP and EBP

A model of consent based on coming to a shared view of the

◆ Benefits and
◆ Risks
judged by the patient’s values VBP

◆ Alternative treatments including the
◆ No treatment option
judged by the best evidence EBP

established through
◆ Dialogue
VBP and EBP come together to support shared decision making
Evidence-based practice is ....

....... a process that supports clinical decision making where there is a challenging evidence base
Values-based practice is ....

....... a process that supports clinical decision making where there is a challenging values base
Montgomery
Many Resources – EBP
David Sackett’s definition of evidence-based medicine ...

... a process that integrates

~best evidence
~clinical experience
~patient values
NICE
Preface to all evidenced-based guidelines for the UK National Health Service...

... When exercising their judgment, professionals are expected to take this guideline fully into account, alongside the individual needs, preferences and values of their patients or service users...
Montgomery

Many Resources – VBP
Montgomery

Many Resources – VBP in psychiatry
Montgomery

Many Resources – VBP in psychiatry

• VB CAMHS Commission
• Core values for Psychiatrists
• Person-centered Care
Montgomery

Many Resources – VBP in medicine
Collaborating Centre for VBP
St Catherine’s College, Oxford
Values-based practice

**Ten Key Process Elements**

- 4 Clinical Skills
- 2 Aspects of the model of service delivery
- 3 Strong links between VBP and EBP
- Partnership in decision-making

Together these support clinical decision making where challenging values are in play
Values-based practice

Ten Key Process Elements

• **4 Clinical Skills**
• 2 Aspects of the model of service delivery
• 3 Strong links between VBP and EBP
• Partnership in decision-making

Together these support clinical decision making where challenging values are in play
Ashok Handa – VB surgical care
Montgomery
Many Resources – shared decision-making
A model of consent based on coming to a shared view of the

- **Benefits** and
- **Risks**
judged by the patient’s values

- **Alternative treatments**
including the
- **No treatment** option
judged by the best evidence

established through
- **Dialogue**
A model of consent based on coming to a shared view of the

- **Benefits** and
- **Risks**
  judged by the **patient’s values**

- **Alternative treatments**
  including the
- **No treatment** option
  judged by the **best evidence**

  established through
- **Dialogue**
What does Montgomery mean for mental health?

It means **Consent depends on Shared Decision-making based on VBP and EBP**
What does Montgomery mean for mental health?

- Montgomery
- Challenges and Resources
- Clinical examples
- Conclusions
Montgomery

Shared decision-making in surgical care
Montgomery

Mrs Jones’ Knee
Mrs. Jones’ Knee

• Referred with painful arthritic knee for prosthetic joint
Mrs. Jones’ Knee

• Referred with painful arthritic knee for prosthetic joint
  • ‘I’m so pleased I will be able to garden again!’
Mrs. Jones’ Knee

• Referred with painful arthritic knee for prosthetic joint
• ‘I’m so pleased I will be able to garden again!’
• ‘... but your mobility may be less post-op’
Mrs. Jones’ Knee

- Referred with painful arthritic knee for prosthetic joint
- ‘I’m so pleased I will be able to garden again!’
- ‘... but your mobility may be less post-op’
- **Conservative management**
Mrs. Jones’ Knee and Shared Decision Making
Mrs. Jones’ Knee and Shared Decision Making

VBP (listening to what mattered to Mrs. Jones – her values)
Mrs. Jones’ Knee and Shared Decision Making

VBP (listening to what mattered to Mrs. Jones – her values) + EBP (understanding the evidence-base for the alternatives available)
Mrs. Jones’ Knee and Shared Decision Making

VBP (listening to what mattered to Mrs. Jones) + EBP (understanding the evidence-base for the alternatives available) =

• Improved clinical outcome
Mrs. Jones’ Knee and Shared Decision Making

VBP (listening to ‘what mattered’ to Mrs. Jones) + EBP (understanding the evidence-base for the alternatives available) =

• **Improved clinical outcome**
• **Better patient experience**
Mrs. Jones’ Knee and Shared Decision Making

VBP (listening to ‘what mattered’ to Mrs. Jones) + EBP (understanding the evidence-base for the alternatives available) =

• Improved clinical outcome
• Better patient experience
• Huge cost savings
VBP and EBP come together to support shared decision making in surgical care.
Montgomery

Shared decision-making in psychiatry
Montgomery relies on **good medical practice**

GMC

Consent:

Patients and doctors making decisions together
Good psychiatric practice follows good medical practice …
VBP and EBP come together to support shared decision making in psychiatry.
Montgomery
Prescribing antipsychotics

Psychosis and schizophrenia in adults: prevention and management

Clinical guideline
Published: 12 February 2014
nice.org.uk/guidance/cg178
Montgomery in psychiatry

Psychosis and schizophrenia in adults: prevention and management

Clinical guideline
Published: 12 February 2014
nice.org.uk/guidance/cg178

Same structure as surgery
Montgomery in psychiatry

Same structure as surgery but

Psychosis and schizophrenia in adults: prevention and management

Clinical guideline
Published: 12 February 2014
nice.org.uk/guidance/cg178
Montgomery in psychiatry

Prescribing anti-psychotics

More Challenging Evidence-base

Psychosis and schizophrenia in adults: prevention and management

Clinical guideline
Published: 12 February 2014
nice.org.uk/guidance/cg178
Montgomery in psychiatry

Prescribing anti-psychotics

More Challenging Evidence-base

More Challenging Values-base
Risk of weight gain
Risk to bodily health
Risk to mental health (recovery)
So weight gain is **really important** to patients
Montgomery in psychiatry

Same structure as surgery but

Do we discuss weight gain when prescribing antipsychotics?
Montgomery in psychiatry

Same structure as surgery but

Do we discuss weight gain when prescribing antipsychotics?

Yet the patient’s values (what is important to the patient) are key to recovery
What does Montgomery mean for mental health?

- Montgomery
- Challenges and Resources
- Clinical examples
- Conclusions
Conclusions

1. Montgomery
   What it means

2. Challenges and Resources
   Values/VBP and Evidence/EBP

3. Clinical examples
   Surgery and psychiatry
Conclusions
What does Montgomery mean for mental health?

It means **Shared Decision-making based on Values and Evidence**
Conclusions
What does Montgomery mean for mental health?

It means **Consent depends on Shared Decision-making based on Values and Evidence**
Conclusions
What does Montgomery mean for mental health?

It means **Consent depends on Shared Decision-making based on VBP and EBP**
Conclusions
What does Montgomery mean for mental health?

Montgomery is challenging in psychiatry
Conclusions
What does Montgomery mean for mental health?

Montgomery is challenging in psychiatry but is key to recovery
Conclusions
What does Montgomery mean for mental health?

Montgomery is challenging in psychiatry but **if we develop our skills in both EBP and VBP it is key to recovery**
Valuesbasedpractice.org

Collaborating Centre for Values-based Practice, St Catherine’s College, Oxford